

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

----- x
IN RE: : MEMORANDUM DECISION
: AND ORDER
TERRORIST ATTACKS ON : 03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)
SEPTEMBER 11, 2001 :
----- x

This document relates to:

DeRubbio, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-5306 (GBD) (SN)
Morris, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-5321 (GBD) (SN)
Ades, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-7306 (GBD) (SN)
Kim, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-11870 (GBD) (SN)
Jimenez, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-11875 (GBD) (SN)
Rivelli, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-11878 (GBD) (SN)
Aamoth, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-12276 (GBD) (SN)
Hemenway, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 18-cv-12277 (GBD) (SN)
Bernaerts, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 19-cv-11865 (GBD) (SN)
Aron, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 20-cv-9376 (GBD) (SN)
Hargrave, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 20-cv-9387 (GBD) (SN)
Asaro, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 20-cv-10460 (GBD) (SN)
Bianco, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 20-cv-10902 (GBD) (SN)
Amato, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 21-cv-10239 (GBD) (SN)
King, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 22-cv-5193 (GBD) (SN)

GEORGE B. DANIELS, United States District Judge:

On June 23, 2023, numerous Plaintiffs in the above-captioned actions moved for partial final default judgments against the Islamic Republic of Iran, seeking pain and suffering, economic, and solatium damages on behalf of those who lost family members in the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks and the estates of those killed. (Pls.' Mot. for Partial Final Js. for Damages, ECF No. 9147.¹) Two Plaintiffs, Port Authority Police Officer William Jose Jimeno and Lieutenant John McLoughlin, move for pain and suffering damages to compensate them for the injuries they

¹ Unless otherwise indicated, all ECF citations included herein refer to documents filed on the 9/11 multidistrict litigation docket. See *In re Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001*, 03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN).

suffered when they miraculously survived the collapse of the World Trade Center. (Pls.’ Mem. of Law in Support of Partial Final Js. for Damages (“Mem.”), ECF No. 9148, at 49–89.) Before the Court is Magistrate Judge Sarah Netburn’s November 28, 2023 Report and Recommendation (the “Report”), recommending that this Court grant Plaintiffs’ motion in part, deny their motion in part without prejudice, and recommending the amounts in which certain Plaintiffs should be awarded damages. (Report, ECF No. 9949, at 2, Ex. A.) Magistrate Judge Netburn advised the parties that failure to file timely objections to the Report would constitute a waiver of those objections on appeal. (*Id.* at 11.) No party has filed any objections.

I. LEGAL STANDARDS

A court “may accept, reject, or modify, in whole or in part, the findings or recommendations” set forth in a magistrate judge’s report. 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(C). The court must review *de novo* the portions of a magistrate judge’s report to which a party properly objects. *Id.* Portions of a magistrate judge’s report to which no or “merely perfunctory” objections are made are reviewed for clear error. *Edwards v. Fischer*, 414 F. Supp. 2d 342, 346–47 (S.D.N.Y. 2006) (citation omitted). Clear error is present only when “upon review of the entire record, [the court is] left with the definite and firm conviction that a mistake has been committed.” *United States v. Snow*, 462 F.3d 55, 72 (2d Cir. 2006) (citation omitted).

Having reviewed the Report for clear error and finding none, this Court ADOPTS Magistrate Judge Netburn’s Report in full.

II. MAGISTRATE JUDGE NETBURN DID NOT ERR IN HER RECOMMENDATIONS ON DAMAGES

Magistrate Judge Netburn did not commit clear error in finding that Iran is liable to these Plaintiffs. (See Report at 2 n.2 (citing entries of default judgment as to Iran’s liability in each of

the above-listed cases).) “What remains is to determine whether the [P]laintiffs are entitled to the damages they request.” (*Id.* at 2.)

A. Denial of Damages

Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in her determination that, at this juncture, the estates of Victoria Alvarez-Brito, Mario Brito, Frederick Kuo Jr., and Michael Lomax are not entitled to damages. (*Id.*) The Plaintiffs advancing these estates’ claims—Jamie Brito, Michael R. Kuo, and Elisa P. Malani—have each petitioned to be state-appointed personal representatives, but their petitions are currently pending. (*Id.*) Accordingly, as Magistrate Judge Netburn recommended, these estates’ requests for default judgments as to damages are DENIED without prejudice. These Plaintiffs may renew their requests for default judgments as to damages if and when their appointments as personal representatives are approved.

B. Economic Damages

Plaintiffs may recover for “economic damages” under 28 U.S.C. § 1605A(c)(4), and “estates of those who [died] can recover economic losses stemming from the wrongful death of the decedent,” *Valore v. Islamic Republic of Iran*, 700 F. Supp. 2d 52, 83 (D.D.C. 2010). “This Court has consistently awarded [economic] damages where those damage calculations are appropriately supported by expert testimony.” (Mem. Decision & Order, ECF No. 9213, at 3 (internal citation omitted).)

Magistrate Judge Netburn properly awarded Plaintiffs economic damages. Plaintiffs’ “economic damages figures are supported by financial analyses performed by economist John Beauzile.” (Report at 2; *see* Economic Reports, ECF Nos. 9149-28 to -32, 9378-1 to -5.) Therefore, Plaintiffs are awarded economic damages as set forth below in Exhibit A.

C. Solatium Damages

There has been a long-established framework for solatium damages awarded to family members of victims who died from the 9/11 attacks. (See Report at 2; Mem. Decision & Order, ECF No. 2623.) Within this framework, solatium damages are awarded as follows: \$12,500,000.00 for spouses, \$8,500,000.00 for parents, \$8,500,000.00 for children, and \$4,250,000.00 for siblings. (ECF No. 2623 at 4.) Magistrate Judge Netburn correctly applied this framework in the Report, and accordingly, Plaintiffs are awarded solatium damages as set forth below in Exhibit A.

D. Pain and Suffering Damages

1. 9/11 Decedents

This Court has long held that those killed in the 9/11 attacks are entitled to a damage award of \$2,000,000.00 per decedent for the “horrific pain and suffering” they endured that day. (ECF No. 2623 at 3.) Magistrate Judge Netburn properly followed this precedent, and this Court awards pain and suffering damages to the estates of 9/11 decedents as set forth below and Exhibit A.

2. Detective William Jose Jimeno and Lieutenant John McLoughlin²

On February 7, 2020, Magistrate Judge Netburn established a framework to award personal injury damages to individual Plaintiffs who had sustained injuries during the 9/11 attacks, which this Court adopted on February 14, 2020. (R. & R. (“Personal Injury Report”), ECF No. 5879, *adopted by* Mem. Decision & Order, ECF No. 5946.) This framework outlined the personal injury awards for individual Plaintiffs and is as follows:

² This Court refers to Detective Jimeno and Lieutenant McLoughlin by their current ranks. (See Report at 4 nn.4–5.)

Category of Injury	Pain and Suffering Damages Award
Significant	\$5,000,000.00
Severe	\$7,000,000.00
Devastating	\$10,000,000.00

(*Id.* at 6.) In the Personal Injury Report, Magistrate Judge Netburn defined and categorized what type of injuries the Court will typically consider to be “significant,” “severe,” or “devastating,” and she also reserved the Court’s discretion to award further upward departures in what appear to be exceptional circumstances. (*Id.* at 6–9.)

Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in her recommendation that this Court exercise its discretion to award Detective Jimeno and Lieutenant McLoughlin damages well above the default rubric. (*See* Report at 4–9.) Both Plaintiffs submitted declarations and exhibits, extensively detailing the injuries they sustained during the 9/11 attacks. (*See* Exs. C, E to Goldman Decl., ECF Nos. 9149-20 to -27, 9149-33 to -54.) The Report accurately describes the relevant injuries as “beyond devastating” and confirms that the medical records reflect these injuries. (*See* Report at 4–9.) Therefore, Detective Jimeno is awarded \$18,000,000.00 in pain and suffering damages, and Lieutenant McLoughlin is awarded \$25,000,000.00 in pain and suffering damages.

E. Prejudgment Interest and Further Damages Applications

Additionally, Magistrate Judge Netburn appropriately found that the Plaintiffs listed in Exhibit A should be awarded prejudgment interest of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually. (Report at 9.) Prejudgment interest will run from September 11, 2001 until the date of judgment for both pain and suffering and solatium damages. (*See id.*) For economic damages,

Magistrate Judge Netburn correctly found that prejudgment interest should run from the following dates until the date of judgment:

- June 1, 2022, for the Estates of David Gary Carlone and Steven Paul Chucknick;
- September 1, 2022, for William Jose Jimeno and John McLoughlin;
- October 1, 2022, for the Estates of John E. Eichler, Virginia E. Fox, Michelle H. Goldstein, and Thomas Michael Regan;
- November 1, 2022, for the Estates of Emerita De La Pena, John Joseph Doherty III, Kathy Nancy Mazza, and John Rhodes;
- December 1, 2022, for the Estates of Patrick Thomas Dwyer, Carl Martin Flickinger, Joseph John Hasson III, James Frances Murphy IV, Joseph Michael Navas, Keith Kevin O'Connor, and Patrick John O'Shea;
- January 1, 2023, for the Estates of Timothy Joseph Finnerty, David Eliot Retik, and Donald Walter Robertson Jr.;
- March 1, 2023, for the Estates of Judith Berquis Diaz-Sierra, Nancy Liz, and Robert David Peraza; and
- April 1, 2023, for the Estate of Joanne Rubino.

(*Id.* at 9–10.) As the Report states, “[a]ll [P]laintiffs in these member cases [are] permitted to submit further applications for damages consistent with any future rulings of the Court.” (*Id.* at 10.)

III. CONCLUSION

Plaintiffs’ Motion for Partial Final Judgments for Damages (ECF No. 9147) is GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED PART. It is:

ORDERED that Plaintiffs' motion for partial final damages judgments for the estates of Victoria Alvarez-Brito, Mario Brito, Frederick Kuo Jr., and Michael Lomax is DENIED without prejudice; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiffs identified in the attached Exhibit A are awarded judgments for pain and suffering, solatium, and economic damages as set forth in Exhibit A; and it is

ORDERED that prejudgment interest is awarded to be calculated at a rate of 4.96 percent per annum as set forth *supra* in Section II.E, all interest compounded annually over the same period; and it is

ORDERED that to the extent they have not done so already, the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A may submit in later stages applications for punitive, economic, and/or other damages awards; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiffs not appearing on Exhibit A and who were not previously awarded damages may submit in later stages applications for punitive, economic, and/or other damages awards.

The Clerk of Court is directed to close the motions at:

- ECF No. 9147 in 03-md-1570;
- ECF No. 268 in 18-cv-5306;
- ECF No. 230 in 18-cv-5321;
- ECF No. 192 in 18-cv-7306;
- ECF No. 208 in 18-cv-11870;
- ECF No. 162 in 18-cv-11875;
- ECF No. 179 in 18-cv-11878;
- ECF No. 195 in 18-cv-12276;

- ECF No. 235 in 18-cv-12277;
- ECF No. 171 in 19-cv-11865;
- ECF No. 157 in 20-cv-9376;
- ECF No. 142 in 20-cv-9387;
- ECF No. 144 in 20-cv-10460;
- ECF No. 135 in 20-cv-10902;
- ECF No. 72 in 21-cv-10239; and
- ECF No. 55 in 22-cv-5193.

Dated: New York, New York

December 14, 2023

SO ORDERED.


GEORGE B. DANIELS
United States District Judge

Exhibit A

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
William Jose Jimeno	N/A	<u>King</u>	\$18,000,000.00		\$3,181,931.00
John McLoughlin	N/A	<u>King</u>	\$25,000,000.00		\$2,660,711.00
Jeannette Ramos, as personal representative of the estate of Anthony Alvarado	Anthony Alvarado	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Anthony Joshua Alvarado	Anthony Alvarado	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Elizabeth Rick, as personal representative of the estate of Scott Daniel Bart	Scott Daniel Bart	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Elizabeth Courtney Rick	Scott Daniel Bart	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Jamie Brito	Victoria Alvarez-Brito	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Raul Brito	Victoria Alvarez-Brito	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Eve Bucca, as personal representative of the estate of Ronald Paul Bucca	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Alfred R. Bucca	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Astrid Bucca	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Eve Elizabeth Bucca	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Robert Bucca	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Ronald Luke Bucca	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Jessica Bucca-Hughes	Ronald Paul Bucca	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Beverly Caralone, as personal representative of the estate of David Gary Caralone	David Gary Caralone	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		\$3,607,825.00
Beverly Deschino Caralone	David Gary Caralone	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Barbara Chucknick, as personal representative of the estate of Steven Paul Chucknick	Steven Paul Chucknick	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		\$3,825,361.00
Barbara Marie Chucknick	Steven Paul Chucknick	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Steven Louis Chucknick	Steven Paul Chucknick	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Stefanie Oliva, as personal representative of the estate of Alex F. Ciccone	Alex F. Ciccone	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Stefanie Marie Oliva	Alex F. Ciccone	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Lidia Alvarez	Juan Pablo Alvarez Cisneros	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Alfonso Cisneros	Juan Pablo Alvarez Cisneros	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Ana Maria Cisneros	Juan Pablo Alvarez Cisneros	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Beth Schutte, as personal representative of the estate of Patricia A. Cody	Patricia A. Cody	<u>Aamoth</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Gabriel De La Pena, as personal representative of the estate of Emerita De La Pena	Emerita De La Pena	<u>Aron</u>			\$5,950,952.00
Ronald Sierra, as personal representative of the estate of Judith Berquis Diaz-Sierra	Judith Berquis Diaz-Sierra	<u>Aron</u>			\$2,254,411.00
Page Dantzler Dickerson, as personal representative of the estate of Jerry Don Dickerson	Jerry Don Dickerson	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Elizabeth Bailey Dickerson	Jerry Don Dickerson	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Page Dantzler Dickerson	Jerry Don Dickerson	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
William Austin Dickerson	Jerry Don Dickerson	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Sol Newman	Debra Ann DiMartino	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Angelo John Puma	Debra Ann DiMartino	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Josephine Tabick	Debra Ann DiMartino	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Nicole Braithwaite-Dingle, as personal representative of the estate of Jeffrey Dingle	Jeffrey Dingle	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Nicole Brathwaite-Dingle	Jeffrey Dingle	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Jassiem Dingle	Jeffrey Dingle	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Nia Dingle	Jeffrey Dingle	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Mary Doherty, as personal representative of the estate of John Joseph Doherty III	John Joseph Doherty III	<u>Bianco</u>			\$3,348,177.00
John G. Duffy, as personal representative of the estate of Christopher Michael Duffy	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Brian Matthew Duffy	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
John Duffy	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Kevin Thomas Duffy	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Kathleen Langan	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Caitlin McCaffrey Meloy	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Kara Anne Mylod	Christopher Michael Duffy	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Jo Ann Dwyer, as personal representative of the estate of Patrick Thomas Dwyer	Patrick Thomas Dwyer	<u>Bianco</u>			\$68,381,557.00
Angela Eacobacci	Joseph Anthony Eacobacci	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Mitchell Joseph Eacobacci	Joseph Anthony Eacobacci	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
John R. Eichler, as personal representative of the estate of John E. Eichler	John E. Eichler	<u>Kim</u>			\$2,229,794.00
Danielle Fehling-Wasnieski, as personal representative of the estate of Lee Stanley Fehling	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Joan M. Bischoff	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
James E. Fehling Jr.	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Kaitlin Nicole Fehling	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Megan Lee Fehling	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Thomas John Fehling	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Danielle Claire Fehling-Wasnieski	Lee Stanley Fehling	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Theresa Roberts, as personal representative of the estate of Timothy Joseph Finnerty	Timothy Joseph Finnerty	<u>Aron</u>			\$7,814,071.00
Lynda T. Scarcella, as personal representative of the estate of Paul Matthew Fiori	Paul Matthew Fiori	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Adriana Marie Fiori	Paul Matthew Fiori	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Debbi Liberta Fiori	Paul Matthew Fiori	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Lynda Theresa Scarcella	Paul Matthew Fiori	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Kathleen Flickinger, as personal representative of the estate of Carl Martin Flickinger	Carl Martin Flickinger	<u>Aron</u>			\$12,249,995.00
Allison Fox-Breland, as personal representative of the estate of Virginia E. Fox	Virginia E. Fox	<u>Ades</u>			\$208,536.00
Jessica Geier, as personal representative of the estate of Paul Hamilton Geier	Paul Hamilton Geier	<u>Amato</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Edward Goldstein, as personal representative of the estate of Michelle H. Goldstein	Michelle H. Goldstein	<u>Aamoth</u>			\$3,252,145.00
Cynthia Gomes, as personal representative of the estate of Dennis James Gomes	Dennis James Gomes	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Cynthia Marie Gomes	Dennis James Gomes	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Mackenzie May Gomes	Dennis James Gomes	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Mary Hasson, as personal representative of the estate of Joseph John Hasson III	Joseph John Hasson III	<u>Asaro</u>			\$3,529,760.00
Petrolina Sencion	Maxima Jean-Pierre	<u>DeRubbio</u>		\$8,500,000.00	

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Greffery John	Charles Gregory John	<u>Hemenway</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Gregory Isaac John	Charles Gregory John	<u>Hemenway</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Marisa Alexus John	Charles Gregory John	<u>Hemenway</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Gillian Marcia Gransaul-Joseph	Stephen Joseph	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Tristan Anthony Joseph	Stephen Joseph	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Jessica Lynn Jurgens	Thomas Edward Jurgens	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Jospeh E. Jurgens	Thomas Edward Jurgens	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Joseph Brian Jurgens	Thomas Edward Jurgens	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Dennis Ketcham, as personal representative of the estate of Douglas Darrell Ketcham	Douglas Darrell Ketcham	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Dennis Ketcham	Douglas Ketcham	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Denyse Danielle Kruse, as personal representative of the estate of Raenell Ketcham	Douglas Ketcham	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Denyse Danielle Kruse	Douglas Ketcham	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Shivam Khandelwal	Rajesh Khandelwal	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Susan M. King, as personal representative of the estate of Amy King	Amy King	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Susan M. King, as personal representative of the estate of Stewart King Jr.	Amy King	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Michael Robert Kuo	Frederick Kuo Jr.	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Kathleen Gelman	Thomas Joseph Kuveikis	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Angelina Jimenez, as personal representative of the estate of Elena Fernanda Ledesma	Elena Fernanda Ledesma	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Angelina Krissy Jimenez	Elena Fernanda Ledesma	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Shanhellen Trissy Jimenez	Elena Fernanda Ledesma	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Anne Lynn Hayashi	Stuart (Soo-Jin) Lee	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Matthew J. Liz-Ramirez, as personal representative of the estate of Nancy Liz	Nancy Liz	<u>Hemenway</u>			\$2,458,029.00
Christopher Delosh, as personal representative of the estate of Kathy Nancy Mazza	Kathy Nancy Mazza	<u>Hargrave</u>			\$3,705,121.00
Anne McCloskey, as personal representative of the estate of Katie M. McCloskey	Katie M. McCloskey	<u>Jimenez</u>	\$2,000,000.00		

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Amy Mulderry, as personal representative of the estate of Stephen Vincent Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Amy Kane Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Andrew Thomas Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Anne McGrath Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Anne Connell Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Daniel Patrick Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Darra D. Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Peter M. Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
William J. Mulderry	Stephen Vincent Mulderry	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Jeanine Murphy, as personal representative of the estate of James Francis Murphy IV	James Francis Murphy IV	<u>Hargrave</u>			\$6,081,230.00
Karen A. Navas, as personal representative of the estate of Joseph Michael Navas	Joseph Michael Navas	<u>Hargrave</u>			\$4,707,950.00
Lorraine Nedell, as personal representative of the estate of Laurence Florian Nedell	Laurence Florian Nedell	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Jennie Nedell	Laurence Florian Nedell	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Laura Nedell	Laurence Florian Nedell	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Lorraine Nedell	Laurence Florian Nedell	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Sandra O'Connor Carey, as personal representative of the estate of Keith Kevin O'Connor	Keith Kevin O'Connor	<u>Asaro</u>			\$8,240,787.00
Sheila O'Shea, as personal representative of the estate of Patrick John O'Shea	Patrick John O'Shea	<u>Bianco</u>			\$2,614,826.00
Valada Penny, as personal representative of the estate of Richard Al Penny	Richard Al Penny	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Richard Tyson Penny	Richard Al Penny	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Valada Berencia Penny	Richard Al Penny	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Neil Peraza, as personal representative of the estate of Robert David Peraza	Robert David Peraza	<u>Asaro</u>			\$1,650,900.00
Linda Pohlmann, as personal representative of the estate of William Howard Pohlmann	William Howard Pohlmann	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Linda Pohlmann	William Howard Pohlmann	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Nicky Santiago	Giovanna Porras	<u>Morris</u>		\$12,500,000.00	

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Masia Shurla Riley, as personal representative of the estate of Scott A. Powell	Scott A. Powell	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Art Edward Powell	Scott Alan Powell	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Sydney Ayesha Powell	Scott Alan Powell	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Scott Alan Watkins	Scott Alan Powell	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Gayle Regan, as personal representative of the estate of Thomas Michael Regan	Thomas Michael Regan	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		\$9,293,281.00
Allaistar Mairead Regan	Thomas Michael Regan	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Connor Patrick Regan	Thomas Michael Regan	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Gayle Diane Regan	Thomas Michael Regan	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Susan Zalesne Retik & Mark Retik, as co-personal representatives of the estate of David Eliot Retik	David Eliot Retik	<u>Hargrave</u>			\$28,331,815.00
Linda Rhodes, as personal representative of the estate of John Rhodes	John Rhodes	<u>Hemenway</u>			\$972,585.00
Thomas Kelleher, as personal representative of the estate of Stephen Roach	Stephen Roach	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Eileen B. Roach	Stephen Louis Roach	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Isabel Roach	Stephen Louis Roach	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Mackenzie A. Roach	Stephen Louis Roach	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Stephen Louis Roach Jr.	Stephen Louis Roach	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Karen Robertson-Jurcziak, as personal representative of the estate of Donald Walter Robertson Jr.	Donald Walter Robertson Jr.	<u>Hargrave</u>			\$8,124,598.00
Antoinette Rubino, as personal representative of the estate of Joanne Rubino	Joanne Rubino	<u>Rivelli</u>			\$497,464.00
Amanda Marie Ruddle	David Michael Ruddle	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Brittley Wise, as personal representative of the estate of Richard Lawrence Salinardi Jr.	Richard Lawrence Salinardi Jr.	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Brittley Christian Wise	Richard Lawrence Salinardi Jr.	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Carlos Gilberto Albert	Ayleen Santiago	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Lisa A. Schunk, as personal representative of the estate of Edward W. Schunk	Edward W. Schunk	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Gail Ingersoll Sezna, as personal representative of the estate of Davis Grier Sezna Jr	Davis Grier Sezna Jr.	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Davis Grier Sezna	Davis Grier Sezna Jr.	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Gail I. Sezna	Davis Grier Sezna Jr.	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Walter William Sezna	Davis Grier Sezna Jr.	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Edith Skrzypek, as personal representative of the estate of Paul Albert Skrzypek	Paul Albert Skrzypek	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Laura Kingsbury	Paul Albert Skrzypek	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Albert John Skrzypek	Paul Albert Skrzypek	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Edith Skrzypek	Paul Albert Skrzypek	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
June Pietruszkiewicz, as personal representative of the estate of James Joseph Suozzo	James Joseph Suozzo	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
June Ryan Pietruszkiewicz	James Joseph Suozzo	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Alexander James Suozzo	James Joseph Suozzo	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Timothy John Suozzo	James Joseph Suozzo	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Simone Lenee Taylor	Donnie Brooks Taylor	<u>Bernaerts</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Vera Schleeter, as personal representative of the estate of Kip Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Ann Marie Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Dean Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Dean Ross Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
John Luke Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Kay Ann Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Vera Schleeter, as personal representative of the estate of Nancy Taylor	Kip Taylor	<u>King</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Artricia McClure	Tamara Ciara Thurman	<u>Ades</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Wilton White	Tamara Ciara Thurman	<u>Ades</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Shari Tolbert, as personal representative of the estate of Kip Taylor	Otis Vincent Tolbert	<u>Bianco</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
Amanda Nicole Tolbert	Otis Vincent Tolbert	<u>Bianco</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Anthony Julian Tolbert	Otis Vincent Tolbert	<u>Bianco</u>		\$8,500,000.00	

Plaintiff	9/11 Decedent	Case	Pain and Suffering Damages	Solatium Damages	Economic Damages
Brittany Lee Tolbert	Otis Vincent Tolbert	<u>Bianco</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Shari Lee Tolbert	Otis Vincent Tolbert	<u>Bianco</u>		\$12,500,000.00	
Judith Knight	Frank Wisniewski	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Judith Knight, as personal representative of the estate of Mary Wisniewski	Frank Wisniewski	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Vincent Wisniewski	Frank Wisniewski	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Raymond Robert Pena	Raymond Robert York	<u>Bernaerts</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
Loubertha Williams, as personal representative of the estate of Jacqueline Young	Jacqueline Young	<u>King</u>	\$2,000,000.00		
James McKenly	Jacqueline Young	<u>King</u>		\$4,250,000.00	
Loubertha Williams	Jacqueline Young	<u>King</u>		\$8,500,000.00	
TOTAL PAIN AND SUFFERING DAMAGES					\$109,000,000.00
TOTAL SOLATIUM DAMAGES					\$963,500,000.00
TOTAL ECONOMIC DAMAGES					\$199,173,812.00
TOTAL DAMAGES					\$1,271,673,812.00